

# QAL Application Requirements and Submittal

To perform appraisal services for the Colorado Department of Transportation (CDOT) on CDOT projects, fee appraisers must be on CDOT's Qualified Appraiser list and have an active procurement agreement. This guide details the requirements and submittals necessary for fee appraisers to be evaluated for inclusion on CDOT's Qualified Appraiser List (QAL).

**Minimum requirement:** The appraiser must hold an active Colorado Certified General Appraiser license and have eminent domain appraisal before and after valuation experience. Do not apply for inclusion on CDOT's QAL if you are not a state Certified General Appraiser.

Appraisers who apply to be included on CDOT's QAL will be evaluated by a panel of three (3) CDOT senior appraisers, moderated by the Statewide Appraisal Program Manager. Requirements are detailed below:

CDOT will not consider submittals for its Qualified Appraiser list that are made within less than one year of a prior submittal by the same applicant.

# **Required Information**

#### **Submission Guidelines**

Applicants must be qualified, responsible Colorado Certified General appraisers, and interested in providing appraisal and follow-up litigation services to CDOT and Local Public Agencies (LPA) to assist in acquiring real property rights necessary for transportation improvement projects. The appraiser applicant bears sole responsibility to ensure that all required information and an Eminent Domain appraisal report prepared by the applicant are submitted to CDOT in the proper form.

#### **Eminent Domain Appraisal Development**

The appraiser will outline and describe Colorado's Modified Before-and-After Eminent Domain appraisal process and describe the typical Scope of Work to complete the process. Submissions must detail the applicant's understanding of, and approach to, eminent domain appraisal development and address how each element of the Scope of Work would be accomplished in a before-and-after eminent domain appraisal. This outline should be submitted in letter format.

#### Appraisal Report - Sample Document

The applicant will submit a signed copy of their most complex, or best example of a partial acquisition eminent domain appraisal report that uses the before-and-after rule. Colorado's Modified State before-and-after rule is preferable. The appraisal report must have been prepared for an actual assignment and for an actual client. "Demonstration Reports" will not be accepted.

The sample eminent domain appraisal report selected for inclusion in the application may have been prepared for any condemning agency or property owner. Do not submit an

eminent domain appraisal report that is still or will be used in litigation by either an agency or property owner in an unresolved right-of-way acquisition.

**Principal Appraiser and Signatory** -- the applicant must have personally performed the appraisal analyses, made the value and compensation conclusions, and prepared the appraisal report submitted with their QAL application. The appraisal report must be signed by the applicant as a sole signatory or as co-signer. In either case, whether as sole signatory or as a co-signer, the applicant **will include a signed statement on the cover of the sample appraisal report** as stated below:

I, \_\_\_\_\_\_, performed the primary appraisal analyses and determined the final valuation and compensation conclusions in this submitted appraisal report.

Sensitive information in the report may be obscured or removed to comply with confidentially requirements.

If more than one individual from an appraiser-staffed firm is applying, each applicant will need to submit a separate and distinct appraisal report on a different property. **CDOT qualifies individual appraisers, not appraisal firms**.

## Experience, References, & License

The applicant shall provide a clear and adequate statement of qualifications and experience to provide appraisal services required by CDOT or LPAs that use CDOT's QAL. Include a list of references (minimum of three) by which CDOT may confirm any experience described.

#### **Appraisal Experience**

Provide evidence of experience performing "appraisal services" (or other related work) for general appraisal assignments, complex appraisals for litigation, and specifically eminent domain appraisals on behalf of CDOT, FHWA, property owners, and/or other public agencies. The information should support the applicant's capability to perform work required by CDOT or other condemning agencies.

#### Litigation Experience

Provide evidence of experience performing "litigation services" including the extent of litigation related services to CDOT, FHWA, property owners, and/or other public agencies at pre-trial conferences, depositions, court appearances, and expert witness testimony concerning the "appraisal services" performed.

- The litigation experience shall include a listing of all federal and state district courts where the applicant has been qualified as an expert witness, and the number of times the applicant has testified as an expert in litigation valuation. Include a complete list of litigation depositions and hearings in which the applicant was qualified as an expert witness.
- Other areas of litigation experience may include but are not limited to immediate possession hearings, administrative hearings, board of equalization testimony, etc.

• Lack of litigation experience will not necessarily preclude the applicant from qualifying as a CDOT-approved appraiser.

#### Education

List and/or describe course work completed in real property appraisal, litigation/eminent domain appraisal, and/or comparable, related fields.

#### Appraisal Specialties

List and/or describe any specialty appraisal expertise. Any information here should detail appraisal experience and/or expertise in appraising special use properties. Such special-use property expertise will be used for assignment of project work and will not disqualify an application, nor will it affect the scoring during the evaluation phase.

#### **Appraiser State Certification**

Include a copy of your Colorado Certified General Appraiser license as issued by the Colorado Board of Real Estate Appraisers.

## **Evaluation Criteria**

#### Review and Approval of Qualified appraisal applicants

This section outlines the evaluation criteria CDOT will use in the review and selection of submitted applications. Applications will be evaluated and scored as described below. Based on the scoring criteria, CDOT's QAL review committee and statewide Appraisal Program Manager will together determine if the applicant meets the requirements to be placed on the Qualified list.

#### **Evaluation Process**

CDOT's Appraisal Program Manager will moderate a panel of three senior CDOT appraisers who will independently evaluate the merit of applications received in accordance with the evaluation factors.

Failure of the applicant to provide any information requested in the application may disqualify the application as non-responsive. It is the applicant's responsibility to provide all information required in the application. The objective of the evaluation will be to recommend approval or rejection of the application based on the submitted documentation and grading of the appraisal report. Note: Prior appraisal report(s), performed by the applicant, that has/have come before CDOT for any reason may be included in the consideration and evaluation of the applicant's eligibility.

## **Application Scoring**

The evaluators' sole objective is to score the application and recommend those applicants who have the required experience, education, qualifying appraisal report, etc. to be included on the Qualified Appraiser List eligible for appraisal and related litigation assignments for CDOT and Local Public Agencies.

## Evaluation Criteria

The appraiser applicant must submit a complete application package to be considered

for CDOT's Qualified Appraiser List. A "complete" application package is defined as all information including letter mentioned above, sample report, resume, references, a copy of your appraisal license, and any additional information pertinent to each of the evaluation factors.

Each of these factors is designed to incorporate specific evaluation of the items presented and it is upon these criteria that the evaluators will base their determination for whether the appraiser will be added to CDOT's QAL.

Applications should be submitted in the format suggested and provide all the details and documentation requested. All submitted reports are subject to verification of data.

All approved applicants will be placed on CDOT's Qualified Appraiser List, thereby preapproved to bid for providing appraisal services to CDOT and eligible to work for LPAs on their federal-aid projects subject to CDOT oversight.

All applicants not approved must wait a minimum of one year before reapplying to CDOT's QAL.

**NOTE:** Inclusion on CDOT's QAL is no guarantee of work to the applicant on the part of CDOT or by any other agency or property owner. CDOT also reserves the right to remove appraisers from its Qualified List as circumstances require.

Eminent Domain Appraisal Development

Applicants will be evaluated on their understanding of eminent domain appraisal and the process and Scope of Work necessary to properly complete an eminent domain appraisal. How does an eminent domain appraisal differ from a mortgage appraisal, for example? Proposals should show the applicant's understanding of a condemning agency's appraisal requirements and make clear their ability to provide the services needed.

Complexity of Sample Report

The evaluation committee will consider the complexity of the sample report, for example, whether it is a strip taking versus a highly complex partial taking with damages and/or benefits.

#### Appraisal Report

**NOTE:** It is preferable that the sample appraisal report submitted should have an effective value date that is no more than four (4) years prior to the date of the QAL application. Older reports may be considered depending on circumstances.

The applicant will be evaluated on the partial acquisition appraisal report submitted. Specifically, evaluation will focus on:

- The appraisal methodology as reflected in the report.
- Basic information in the report (e.g., letter of transmittal, certification, assumptions and limiting conditions, market value definition, effective date of appraisal and value, state, region and/or neighborhood data, and exhibits).

- Subject property data and analysis (e.g., larger parcel description, land data, improvement data, sales history, zoning, utilities, etc., and highest and best use before and after the taking).
- The highest and best use Analysis and value of the larger parcel using appropriate approaches to value.
- Residue (remainder) value before the taking or acquisition.
- The highest and best use analysis and value of the residue (remainder) after the taking or acquisition.
- Analysis of damages and/or benefits (whether yes or no) and compensation summary. If there are damages, whether they are curable or not and whether they are compensable or not.
- The perceived level of sound judgment exercised by the applicant in the valuation problem.
- The level of support within the valuation problem and conclusions.
- The submitted report should demonstrate Colorado Eminent Domain procedures.

#### Appraisal and Litigation Experience

The applicant will be evaluated on their **appraisal experience**. Specifically:

- Extent of experience conducting general or typical appraisal assignments
- Extent of experience conducting eminent domain appraisals
- Extent of other appraisals for litigation purposes

The applicant will be evaluated on their **litigation experience**. Specifically:

- Demonstrated litigation experience related to appraisal work
- Experience with litigation services, including but not limited to:
  - Pre-trial conferences and depositions
  - Immediate possession hearings, board of equalization hearings, administrative hearings, etc.
  - Qualified as an expert witness
  - Trial testimony
  - Other litigation related experience

#### Education

Each applicant will be evaluated on the extent of their educational background in real property appraisal and litigation, condemnation, and eminent domain, including:

- Courses and seminars for state certification and continuing education
- Advanced appraisal courses and seminars
- Litigation, condemnation, and eminent domain courses and seminars

# **Application Submittal**

Deliver complete application package to the CDOT Statewide Appraisal Program Manager via email (pdf) or mail to the address below.

Dennis Blea dennis.blea@state.co.us CDOT Statewide Appraisal Program Manager 2829 W. Howard Place, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Denver CO 80204